

CDM-ARWG38

Meeting report

Afforestation and Reforestation Working Group thirty-eighth meeting

Version 01.0

Date of meeting: 14 to 16 August 2013

Place of meeting: Bonn, Germany



United Nations
Framework Convention on
Climate Change

TABLE OF CONTENTS		Page
AGENDA ITEM 1.	AGENDA AND MEETING ORGANIZATION	3
Agenda item 1.1.	Opening.....	3
Agenda item 1.2.	Adoption of the agenda.....	3
AGENDA ITEM 2.	GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT MATTERS	3
Agenda item 2.1.	Membership issues	3
Agenda item 2.2.	Performance management	3
Agenda item 2.3.	Matters related to the A/R WG.....	3
Agenda item 2.3.1.	Upcoming deadlines of relevance to stakeholders.....	4
AGENDA ITEM 3.	REGULATORY MATTERS	4
Agenda item 3.1.	Standards/tools	4
Agenda item 3.1.1.	Consultation on issues related to standards/tools.....	4
Agenda item 3.1.2.	Consideration of revision of methodological standards.....	5
Agenda item 3.1.3.	Global stakeholder consultation.....	10
Agenda item 3.2.	Procedures.....	10
Agenda item 3.2.1.	Consideration of revision of methodological procedures.....	10
Agenda item 3.2.2.	Consultation on issues related to procedures	11
Agenda item 3.3.	Guidelines	11
Agenda item 3.3.1.	Consultation on issues related to guidelines	11
AGENDA ITEM 4.	CONCLUSION OF THE MEETING	11
Agenda item 4.1.	Adoption of the report	11
Agenda item 4.2.	Closure of the meeting.....	12
ANNEXES TO THE REPORT		13

Agenda item 1. Agenda and meeting organization

Agenda item 1.1. Opening

1. The secretariat welcomed and introduced the new Chair of the Afforestation and Reforestation Working Group (hereinafter referred to as the A/R WG) Mr. Amjad Abdulla, and Vice-Chair Ms. Diana Harutyunyan.
2. The Chair of the A/R WG Mr. Amjad Abdulla opened the meeting.
3. The Chair welcomed the new members Mr. Sabin Guendehou and Mr. Ederson Augusto Zanetti as well as the rest of the A/R WG members. On behalf of the A/R WG, the Chair expressed deep appreciation to the outgoing Chair Mr. Eduardo Calvo and the outgoing members Mr. Shailendra Kumar Singh, Mr. Marcelo Rocha, Mr. Larwanou Mahamane, and Mr. Raul Ponce-Hernandez. The long-standing and pioneering contribution of Mr. Shailendra Kumar Singh was especially noted as Mr Singh had been a member of the A/R WG since its first meeting.
4. The Chair noted that Ms. Sarah Walker was unable to attend.

Table 1. Attendance list

Chair and Vice-Chair	Members
Mr. Amjad Abdulla (Chair)	Mr. Ederson Augusto Zanetti
Ms. Diana Harutyunyan (Vice-Chair)	Mr. Neil Bird
	Mr. Sabin Guendehou
	Mr. Xiaoquan Zhang

Agenda item 1.2. Adoption of the agenda

5. The agenda was adopted as proposed.

Agenda item 2. Governance and management matters

Agenda item 2.1. Membership issues

6. The A/R WG considered information provided by members with respect to any potential conflict of interest.

Agenda item 2.2. Performance management

7. The A/R WG considered a status report on the implementation of the A/R WG 2013 workplan and the recent updates as reported at the seventy-fourth meeting of the Executive Board of the clean development mechanism (hereinafter referred to as the Board).

Agenda item 2.3. Matters related to the A/R WG

8. The Chair and Vice-Chair briefed the A/R WG on the outcomes from the Board of relevance to the A/R WG since its last meeting.

9. The A/R WG received an update on the meetings of the Small-Scale Working Group (SSC WG) and the Methodologies Panel (Meth Panel) outlining the main actions and recommendations of relevance to the A/R WG.
10. The A/R WG noted the relevant editorial changes to methodological standards since the last meeting in accordance with the "Procedure for the development, revision and clarification of baseline and monitoring methodologies and methodological tools" (version 01.1) effective as of 1 April 2013, as well as fast-track clarification finalized prior to 1 April 2013 in accordance with the earlier procedure:
 - (a) Editorial revision of the tool "Demonstrating appropriateness of volume equations for estimation of aboveground tree biomass in A/R CDM projects activities". The editorial revision incorporates the relevant content of the response to the request for clarification AR_AM_CLA_20 and deletes the reference to the guidelines already withdrawn;
 - (b) Editorial revision of the "Guidelines on accounting of specified types of changes in A/R CDM project activities from the description in registered project design document". The editorial revision replaces the provisional title with the actual titles of the approved tools;
 - (c) Clarification: AR_AM_CLA_0019: "General guidance on cases where the uncertainty in estimation of carbon stocks exceeds allowable maximum uncertainty";
 - (d) Clarification: AR_AM_CLA_0020: "Clarifications on: A/R rate in the baseline under AR-ACM0003; 2) Estimation of carbon stocks at the start of the A/R CDM project activity (CTREE_BSL); 3) Application EB50 Annex 23".

Agenda item 2.3.1. Upcoming deadlines of relevance to stakeholders

11. The A/R WG noted that, as a consequence of the Board's decisions as specified in paragraph 19 of the report of the seventy-first meeting of the Board (EB 71), stakeholders may submit at any time requests for clarifications and revisions and proposals for new methodologies and that such submissions will be considered continuously. The A/R WG further noted that, if a submission should require substantial consideration it should be received by the secretariat 15 days prior to the next Board meeting, in order to present the issue to the Board and consider scheduling a meeting if needed.
12. The A/R WG further noted that project participants, designated national authorities (DNAs) and other stakeholders may note that the next Board meeting is scheduled to be held from 30 September to 4 October 2013, and that the deadline for submissions to the A/R WG in line with paragraph 11 above is 13 September 2013.

Agenda item 3. Regulatory matters

Agenda item 3.1. Standards/tools

Agenda item 3.1.1. Consultation on issues related to standards/tools

13. The A/R WG considered the issues related to the inclusion of A/R clean development mechanism (CDM) component project activities (CPAs) in A/R CDM programmes of activities (POAs) as presented by the secretariat and provided feedback to the secretariat in accordance with the request from the Board at EB 74. The A/R WG is of the view that the exceptions allowed for A/R project activities and PoAs should be maintained as indicated under paragraph 128(c) and footnote 18 of the CDM Project Standard, and also agreed to propose that the requirements for prior consideration of the CDM should be applied to A/R CPAs as is the case for normal A/R project activities. The feedback will be presented for the consideration of the Board at EB 75.

Agenda item 3.1.2. Consideration of revision of methodological standards

14. The relevant procedure "Development, revision and clarification of baseline and monitoring methodologies and methodological tools" (version 01.1) is available at: <<http://cdm.unfccc.int/Reference/Procedures/index.html#meth>>.
15. The A/R WG noted that no external requests for revisions were submitted for consideration by the A/R WG.
16. The A/R WG considered top-down-initiated revisions of approved methodologies (AM) and approved tools (AT) listed in table 2, taking into account desk reviews and public inputs received, where applicable.

Table 2. Status of consideration of revisions of methodological standards

Issue	AM/AT	Mandate	Status/ recommendation	Paragraph
Revision of tool	"Estimation of carbon stocks and change in carbon stocks of trees and shrubs in A/R CDM project activities"	2013 Workplan	To approve the revision	17(a)
Revision of tool	"Estimation of carbon stocks and change in carbon stocks in dead wood and litter in A/R CDM project activities"	2013 Workplan	To approve the revision	17(b)
Revision of approved methodologies to allow use of approved standardized baselines	AR-AM0014: Afforestation and reforestation of degraded mangrove habitats	EB 73	To approve the revision	17(d)
Revision of approved methodologies to allow use of approved standardized baselines	AR-ACM0003: Afforestation and reforestation of lands except wetlands	EB 73	To approve the revision	17(e)

Issue	AM/AT	Mandate	Status/ recommendation	Paragraph
Revision of approved methodologies to allow use of approved standardized baselines	AR-AMS0003: Simplified baseline and monitoring methodology for small scale CDM afforestation and reforestation project activities implemented on wetlands	EB 73	To approve the revision	17(f)
Revision of approved methodologies to allow use of approved standardized baselines	AR-AMS0007: Simplified baseline and monitoring methodology for small scale CDM afforestation and reforestation project activities implemented on lands other than wetlands	EB 73	To approve the revision	17(g)
Revision of tool (consolidation)	"Estimation of the increase in GHG emissions attributable to displacement of pre-project agricultural activities in A/R CDM project activity"	2013 Workplan	To approve the revision	17(c)
Consolidation	"Guidance related to market leakage"	2013 Workplan	To withdraw guidance	18(a)
Consolidation	"Guidance related to pre-project emissions in methodologies applying baseline scenario corresponding to the approach defined in paragraph 22(b) of the decision"	2013 Workplan	To withdraw guidance	18(b)
Consolidation	"Guidelines on conditions under which increase in GHG emissions attributable to displacement of pre-project crop cultivation activities in A/R CDM project activity is insignificant"	2013 Workplan	To withdraw guidelines	18(c)
Consolidation	"Guidelines on conditions under which increase in GHG emissions related to displacement of pre-project grazing activities in A/R CDM project activity is insignificant"	2013 Workplan	To withdraw guidelines	18(d)

17. In consideration of the top-down work undertaken to improve methodological standards, the A/R WG recommended that the Board approve the following revised methodologies and tools:

- (a) Tool for “Estimation of carbon stocks and change in carbon stocks of trees and shrubs in A/R CDM project activities”. The tool was last revised at EB 70. The draft revised tool as contained in [annex 1](#) takes into account the inputs received in response to the call for public inputs (open from 24 May to 24 June 2013). The draft revised tool:
- (i) Allows the use of remote sensing data (e.g. the Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI)) and the use of other secondary variables (e.g. basal area);
 - (ii) Allows monitoring without conducting an inventory and provides flexibility in the choice of different methods;
 - (iii) Incorporates the relevant content of clarification AR_AM_CLA_20.
- (b) Tool for “Estimation of carbon stocks and change in carbon stocks in dead wood and litter in A/R CDM project activities”. The tool was last revised at EB 67 and the draft revision as contained in [annex 2](#) incorporates conditions for the use of deadwood as fuel wood for addressing concerns of environmental integrity.
- (c) Tool for “Estimation of the increase in GHG emissions attributable to displacement of pre-project agricultural activities in A/R CDM project activity”. The tool was adopted at EB 51 and the draft revision as contained in [annex 3](#):
- (i) Incorporates related Board decisions (e.g. market leakage, leakage as increase in emission above pre-project level);
 - (ii) Delinks leakage emission from the project carbon stocks;
 - (iii) Estimates leakage from actual carbon stocks in the receiving lands;
 - (iv) Uses a revised template and thus enhances readability and consistency.
- (d) AR-AM0014: “Afforestation and reforestation of degraded mangrove habitats”. The methodology was last revised at EB 70 and the draft revision as contained in [annex 4](#):
- (i) Corrects the variable relating to soil organic carbon (SOC) in equation (3);
 - (ii) Expands the applicability by allowing the use of approved standardized baselines.
- (e) AR-ACM0003: “Afforestation and reforestation of lands except wetlands”. The methodology was adopted at EB 70 and the draft revision as contained in [annex 5](#) expands the applicability by allowing the use of approved standardized baselines.
- (f) AR-AMS0003: “Simplified baseline and monitoring methodology for small scale CDM afforestation and reforestation project activities implemented on wetlands”. The methodology was last revised at EB 68 and the draft revision as contained in [annex 6](#):
- (i) Expands the applicability by allowing the use of approved standardized baselines;

- (ii) Uses a revised template and thus enhances readability and consistency.
 - (g) AR-AMS0007: "Simplified baseline and monitoring methodology for small scale CDM afforestation and reforestation project activities implemented on lands other than wetlands". The methodology was last revised at EB 68 and the draft revision as contained in annex 7:
 - (i) Expands the applicability by allowing the use of approved standardized baselines;
 - (ii) Uses a revised template and thus enhances readability and consistency.
- 18. The A/R WG recommended that the Board withdraw the following guidance and guidelines issued by the Board as these have been fully incorporated into the draft revised tool recommended for approval: "Estimation of the increase in GHG emissions attributable to displacement of pre-project agricultural activities in A/R CDM project activity":
 - (a) "Guidance related to market leakage";
 - (b) "Guidance related to pre-project emissions in methodologies applying baseline scenario corresponding to the approach defined in paragraph 22(b) of the decision 5/CMP.1";
 - (c) "Guidelines on conditions under which increase in GHG emissions attributable to displacement of pre-project crop cultivation activities in A/R CDM project activity is insignificant";
 - (d) "Guidelines on conditions under which increase in GHG emissions related to displacement of pre-project grazing activities in A/R CDM project activity is insignificant".
- 19. The A/R WG further noted that the consolidation process of A/R methodological standards, guidelines and clarifications has been completed with the recommendations contained in this report. In this process further documents have been identified which, throughout the consolidation process and due to general improvements in A/R methodologies and in methodological standards and procedures, have become redundant. The A/R WG reviewed the list of A/R methodological documents available to stakeholders and agreed to recommend that the Board withdraw the following A/R methodological documents as the content of these is no longer needed in stand-alone documents:
 - (a) "Tool for the Demonstration and Assessment of Additionality in A/R CDM Project Activities":
 - (i) The provisions of this tool are already contained in the "Combined tool to identify the baseline scenario and demonstrate additionality in A/R CDM project activities";
 - (ii) All A/R methodologies refer to the "Combined tool to identify the baseline scenario and demonstrate additionality in A/R CDM project activities".
 - (b) Tool for "Estimation of GHG emissions related to fossil fuel combustion in A/R CDM project activities":

- (i) Not applicable anymore as all methodologies require that emissions from fossil fuels be accounted as zero.
- (c) “Procedure to determine when accounting of the soil organic carbon pool may be conservatively neglected in CDM A/R project activities”:
 - (i) The provisions of this procedure are already contained in the "Tool for estimation of change in soil organic carbon stocks due the implementation of A/R CDM project activities";
 - (ii) No requirement for application of this tool in the A/R methodologies.
- (d) Tool for “Estimation of direct nitrous oxide emission from nitrogen fertilization”:
 - (i) Not applicable anymore as all methodologies require that emissions of nitrous oxide from nitrogen fertilization be accounted as zero.
- (e) Tool for “Calculation of GHG emissions due to leakage from increased use of non-renewable woody biomass attributable to an A/R CDM project activity”:
 - (i) Not applicable anymore as all methodologies require that emissions from "use of wood" be accounted as zero.
- (f) "Tool for the identification of degraded or degrading lands for consideration in implementing CDM A/R project activities":
 - (i) Not applicable anymore since the methodologies allow projects on non-degraded lands as well, and its content has been carried over to the draft revised tool “Estimation of carbon stocks and change in carbon stocks of trees and shrubs in A/R CDM project activities”.
- (g) “Guidance on accounting GHG emissions in A/R CDM project activities” (part I and part II):
 - (i) The provisions of both part I and part II have been incorporated into the A/R methodologies.
- (h) “Guidance on conditions under which the change in carbon stocks in existing live woody vegetation are insignificant” (version 01”):
 - (i) Not required anymore as baseline removals are estimated by applying the tool for “Estimation of carbon stocks and change in carbon stocks of trees and shrubs in A/R CDM project activities”, which includes a simplified default method for this purpose.
- (i) “Guidance on size of the losses of carbon due to the construction of access roads”:
 - (i) Not applicable anymore as all methodologies require that emissions from "construction of access roads" be accounted as zero.
- (j) “Guidelines on conditions under which GHG emissions from removal of existing vegetation due to site preparation are insignificant”:

- (i) Not required anymore. Removal of woody vegetation is accounted for as change in carbon stock in the methodologies.
20. If approved by the Board, the revised methodological standards will become effective from the date of publication on the UNFCCC website following the approval of the Board, and earlier versions and the withdrawn methodological standards and guidance shall remain valid for a period of 240 days.¹

Agenda item 3.1.3. Global stakeholder consultation

21. The A/R WG noted that in line with the "Procedure for the development, revision and clarification of baseline and monitoring methodologies and methodological tools" and following the above recommendations for approval, calls for public inputs will be launched, on the UNFCCC website for stakeholder interaction after publication of the report of the 38th meeting of the A/R WG, on the following draft revised methodological standards:
- (a) Tool "Estimation of the increase in GHG emissions attributable to displacement of pre-project agricultural activities in A/R CDM project activity";
 - (b) Tool "Estimation of carbon stocks and change in carbon stocks in dead wood and litter in A/R CDM project activities";
 - (c) AR-AM0014: Afforestation and reforestation of degraded mangrove habitats;
 - (d) AR-ACM0003: Afforestation and reforestation of lands except wetlands;
 - (e) AR-AMS0003: Simplified baseline and monitoring methodology for small scale CDM afforestation and reforestation project activities implemented on wetlands;
 - (f) AR-AMS0007: Simplified baseline and monitoring methodology for small scale CDM afforestation and reforestation project activities implemented on lands other than wetlands.
22. The A/R WG further noted that an additional call for public input will be launched on the draft revised "Procedures to demonstrate the eligibility of lands for afforestation and reforestation CDM project activities", following the recommendation for approval of this revision (see paragraph 24 below). The call will be launched on the UNFCCC website for stakeholder interaction.
23. The calls for public input are available at: <http://cdm.unfccc.int/public_inputs/index.html>

Agenda item 3.2. Procedures

Agenda item 3.2.1. Consideration of revision of methodological procedures

24. The A/R WG considered a top-down-initiated revision of the approved "Procedures to demonstrate the eligibility of lands for afforestation and reforestation CDM project activities" and recommended that the Board approve the draft revised procedure as contained in annex 8. The draft revised procedure:

¹ "Procedure for the development, revision and clarification of baseline and monitoring methodologies and methodological tools", paragraphs 87 and 88.

- (a) Incorporates related Board decisions (e.g. multi-storey forests, inclusion or exclusion of palms and bamboos);
 - (b) Removes the distinction between the requirements for demonstration of land eligibility for “afforestation” versus “reforestation”;
 - (c) Changes the title of the procedure from “Procedures to demonstrate the eligibility of lands for afforestation and reforestation CDM project activities” to tool for “Demonstration of eligibility of lands for A/R CDM project activities”, in line with the nature of the document.
25. The A/R WG recommended that the Board withdraw the following policy clarifications issued by the Board as these have been fully incorporated into the draft revised “Procedures to demonstrate the eligibility of lands for afforestation and reforestation CDM project activities” recommended for approval in paragraph 24 above:
- (a) “Clarification on application of the A/R CDM definition of “forest” to stands with several storeys of trees differing in height”;
 - (b) “Further clarification on application of the A/R CDM definition of “forest” to stands with several storeys of trees differing in height”.

Agenda item 3.2.2. Consultation on issues related to procedures

26. The A/R WG considered the draft "Proposed amendments in Modalities and procedures for A/R CDM project activities to allow flexibility in timing of verification and certification" as presented by the secretariat and provided feedback to the secretariat in accordance with the mandate provided in the CDM management plan (MAP) (Project 204 "Enhancing cost-effectiveness of A/R CDM projects"). After consideration, the A/R WG agreed with the draft proposal presented by the secretariat.

Agenda item 3.3. Guidelines

Agenda item 3.3.1. Consultation on issues related to guidelines

27. The A/R WG considered the draft "Manual for development of A/R CDM project activities" as presented by the secretariat, and provided feedback to the secretariat in accordance with the mandate in the CDM MAP (Project 191 "Development and publication of A/R CDM Manual"). The A/R WG agreed that the manual was a step forward in the direction of making the A/R CDM methodologies more accessible to interested stakeholders. The A/R WG also suggested that after publication of the manual, it should be made available in French and Spanish. It was also agreed that the members of the A/R WG will provide additional inputs on the draft manual after the meeting since the time available for this was not adequate during the meeting.

Agenda item 4. Conclusion of the meeting

Agenda item 4.1. Adoption of the report

28. The A/R WG dealt with methodology and case-specific issues, including a submission to the secretariat and made recommendations to the Board, in line with the 2013 workplan of the A/R WG.

29. The A/R WG adopted the report and concluded its 38th meeting. The report and annexes will be made available on the UNFCCC website.

Agenda item 4.2. Closure of the meeting

30. The Chair of the A/R WG closed the meeting.

Annexes to the report

Annexes to the external report of the 38th meeting of the Afforestation and Reforestation Working Group

- Annex 1 - Draft revision of the Tool "Estimation of carbon stocks and change in carbon stocks of trees and shrubs in A/R CDM project activities";
- Annex 2 - Draft revision of the Tool "Estimation of carbon stocks and change in carbon stocks in dead wood and litter in A/R CDM project activities";
- Annex 3 - Draft revision of the Tool "Estimation of the increase in GHG emissions attributable to displacement of pre-project agricultural activities in A/R CDM project activity";
- Annex 4 - Draft revision of AR-AM0014: "Afforestation and reforestation of degraded mangrove habitats";
- Annex 5 - Draft revision of AR-ACM0003: "Afforestation and reforestation of lands except wetlands";
- Annex 6 - Draft revision of AR-AMS0003: "Simplified baseline and monitoring methodology for small scale CDM afforestation and reforestation project activities implemented on wetlands";
- Annex 7 - Draft revision of AR-AMS0007: "Simplified baseline and monitoring methodology for small scale CDM afforestation and reforestation project activities implemented on lands other than wetlands";
- Annex 8 - Draft revision of the "Procedures to demonstrate the eligibility of lands for afforestation and reforestation CDM project activities".

- - - - -

Document information

<i>Version</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Description</i>
01.0	21 August 2013	A/R WG 38 meeting report.

Decision Class: Operational
Document Type: Meeting report
Business Function: Governance
Keywords: reporting procedures, AR WG
